

MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
DOMESTIC VIOLENCE COORDINATING COUNCIL

January 27, 2000  
MAG Offices - Saguaro Room  
302 N. First Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Tom Ambrose, Phoenix Suns

William Arnold, Mayor of Goodyear

Tracy Bame, Phelps Dodge Corp.

\*Harriet Barnes, Governor's Division of  
Domestic Violence Prevention

Peggy Bilsten, Councilmember of Phoenix

Dr. Mary Ellen Bradshaw, Az Public Health  
Assoc.

\*Mike Branham, Criminal Justice Commission  
Margaretta Brede Mathis, Fresh Start Womens  
Foundation

\*Jan Brewer, Maricopa County Supervisor

\*Patti Bruno, Councilmember of Chandler  
Monalou Callery, Governor's Division of  
Domestic Violence Prevention

Tom Canasi, City of Tempe

Maggie Cathey, Vice Mayor, Town of Gilbert  
Dean Coonrod, Maricopa Integrated Health  
Systems/Medpro

Sandy Cowen Miller, The Cowen Agency

Gene D'Adamo, The Arizona Republic

Sheila Day-Geary, John C. Lincoln Hospital

\*David Easchief, Salt River Pima Maricopa  
Indian Community

Dr. Paul Eppinger, Arizona Ecumenical Council

\*Mike Evans, Councilmember of Gilbert

Kathleen Ferraro, ASU

Margarita Garcia, Councilmember of Guadalupe

Paulla Garcia, Avondale Social Services

David Goulet, Councilmember of Glendale

Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, Az. Regional Community  
Policing Inst.

Roger Illingworth, Dept. Of Public Safety

Vince Imbordino, Maricopa County Attorney's  
Office

Sanford Kravitz, Arizona Community Foundation  
Rev. Deborah Lerner, Paradise Valley United  
Methodist

\*Marie Lopez-Rogers, Councilmember of  
Avondale

Cynthia Lukas, Councilmember of Scottsdale

Preston McMurry, McMurry Publishing

Carolyn McBurney, 3TV/KTVK

Laura Miller, Attorney Generals Office

Stephanie Orr, Center Against Sexual Abuse

Paul Oves, Tosco Marketing Company

Rev. Fran Park, NW Valley Community Council

Janice Parker, Save the Family Foundation

\*David Petersen, Arizona State Senate

Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center

Michelle Robson, Robson Communities

Angie Rodgers, Children's Action Alliance

\*Frank Scarpati, East Valley Addiction Council

\*Joan Shafer, Mayor of Surprise

Marie Sullivan, AZ Womens Education and  
Employment

\*Ann Timmer, Attorney At Law

Lt. Louie Tovar, Domestic Violence Unit,  
Phoenix, P.D.

Margaret Trujillo, Value Options

\*Roberta Voss, Arizona House of  
Representatives

Mary Wambach, AZ Coalition Against Domestic  
Violence

John Pombier for Kerry G. Wangberg, Law  
Department/ Criminal Division  
Phillip Westbrook, Councilmember of Chandler  
\*Christina Wildlake, Arizona Sexual Assault  
Network  
Greg Shaw Williams, Avondale City Prosecutor  
*\*Those members neither present nor  
represented by proxy.*

#### OTHERS PRESENT

Carla Averil, Area Agency on Aging  
Jerry Boone, Maricopa County Department of  
Public Health  
Bahney Dedolph, Az Coalition Against Domestic  
Violence  
Pat Dennis, City of Peoria  
Laura Guild, DES  
Shelly Hornback, Center Against Sexual Abuse  
Oscar Ramos, Prensa Hispana  
Lynn Timmons, City of Phoenix  
Carol Kratz, MAG  
Suzanne Quigley, MAG  
Mary Thomson, MAG

#### 1. Call To Order, Welcome and Introductions

The meeting was called to order at 2:15 p.m. by Councilmember Peggy Bilsten. Councilmember Bilsten thanked the members for their willingness to serve on this regional council and stressed that this is an action committee and we will make a difference in domestic violence. Councilmember Bilsten introduced Tom Canasi, who will serve as vice-chairman.

#### 2. History of MAG Plan and Meeting Purpose

Tom Canasi reviewed the previous committee work on the domestic violence issue. He commented that the domestic violence plan will be meaningless unless we all move forward together toward implementation. The input we secured from the community around this issue of domestic violence was important, but now must be implemented.

Mr. Canasi reviewed the purpose of MAG and its planning activities. The goal of MAG is to work together on regional issues. Members include all of the local governments in the Valley, the County and two Indian communities. The area is the size of Rhode Island, and many of the problems are common to all of our jurisdictions.

Mr. Canasi summarized the planning areas that MAG is involved in - human services, land use, air quality and transportation. He reviewed the policy structure, summarizing that the Regional Council is composed of the chief elected officials; the Management Committee is comprised of local government managers; the Human Services Committees and the spin off committees related to homelessness and domestic violence.

A regional approach to domestic violence is essential, since there are no borders to domestic violence. This issue impacts multiple systems related to children, families, neighborhoods. This is a pervasive issue. It is not defined by geography or income. This issue is brutal on children, families, ability of children to learn, impacts police, fire, courts, prosecutors and business.

The key elements of a regional plan were summarized. Mr. Canasi commented that our efforts should result

in a national model for a region of our size.

We are pursuing a multi-disciplinary approach, looking at a number of different aspects of domestic violence. There were 150 people who participated in the development of 41 recommendations. The formation of the Domestic Violence Regional Coordinating Council is one of those recommendations.

There will be four subcommittees involved in the areas of prevention, early intervention, crisis and transitional response, long term response and system coordination. We now have dedicated staff to this project, with Mary Thomson funded by a grant from the Governor's Office. He thanked Councilmember Bilsten for her leadership in domestic violence and for agreeing to act as chairman of the committee.

### 3. Introductions

Members were asked to introduce themselves. Representatives are from many different backgrounds, including the religious sector, health care, the service providers, elected officials, education, law enforcement, advocacy organizations, behavioral health, Arizona State University, prosecutors, the business and sports areas. Some of the members described their current roles in domestic violence activities and their hopes for the council.

Many of the representatives around the table have devoted considerable time to various aspects of domestic violence. One member thanked everyone for agreeing to be a part of the process and stressed that addressing domestic violence needs to be a coordinated regionwide process.

Preston McMurry stated that on January 1, 2001, McMurry Publishing will commit \$1 million to a capital campaign to domestic violence and child abuse. He also indicated that McMurry Publishing has developed its own domestic violence program, which supports its staff members who are victims of domestic violence.

Rev. Paul Eppinger commented that we need more cultural diversity around the table. He stressed that we need to expand our committee to bring more representation.

### 4. Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence - the Face of Domestic Violence

Ms. Christina Rivera from the Arizona Coalition Against Domestic Violence (ACADV), presented information about domestic violence. She began by introducing a public service announcement showing the impact of domestic violence on children. Ms. Rivera reviewed information provided by the Arizona Department of Economic Security. She indicated that the numbers of those who are victims and those who are served are probably not accurate, because of under-reporting. She indicated that increasing the number of shelter beds is not the answer to domestic violence. There are many aspects of this issue, including holding batterers accountable for their actions, and preventing domestic violence in the first place.

The demographics of domestic violence reveal that victims come from all ethnic groups. Referrals are made primarily to transportation and affordable housing. Many victims who access shelter remain in a safe place; only 2% of batterers moved out of their homes. Women, who are most often the victims, leave their homes. Leaving doesn't solve the problem, because batterers will offend again with another woman in the same home.

Some basic statistics reveal that 37,362 hours of residential counseling were provided to 2,540 women and

children in Maricopa County. Outpatient counseling was also provided to 676 women and children.

The issue of domestic violence is an issue of power and control. It is not about drugs and alcohol; it is not about stress and anger - it is about power and control and the many different ways perpetrators can use power and control. Tactics include intimidations, using emotional abuse, using isolation, minimizing, denying and blaming. Victims often do not acknowledge the abuse. Tactics also involve using children, using privilege, using economic abuse and using coercion and threats.

Types of abuse include physical, sexual, emotional, mental, verbal and financial abuse. Many of us are not aware that our homes and our partners are not safe.

#### 5. Committee Process and Expectations and Future Agenda Items.

Chairman Bilsten asked members to review the MAG Regional Domestic Violence Plan for the future work of the council. Councilman Bilsten then introduced Mary Thomson to review expectations of the Council. Ms. Thomson began by summarizing a preliminary survey of other councils and identifying a trend that exists among successful councils - paid staff and cookies at every meeting. She then opened the floor for comment on expectations of members role on the council.

Chairman Bilsten began by identifying the lack of follow through on this issue in the Justice of the Peace system. She also touched on the effectiveness of the Court Watch program and inquired about how can we effectively change the way Justice of the Peace look at domestic violence.

Councilmember Cathey added the need for programs in the courts to assist judges in taking the necessary action.

Gene D'Adamo stressed the need to make sure that the Council will serve as the primary vocal point for implementing solutions to domestic violence in Maricopa County. He also stated that we need to make sure all other groups fell under the same umbrella and are on board with this concept.

Mary Ellen Bradshaw commented on the need to include representation from Maricopa County Public Health on the Council. She also stressed the correlation between animal abuse and domestic violence. She suggested that perhaps we should also include AZ Human Society representation on the Council. Ms. Thomson indicated that public health will be included in subcommittees.

Sheila Day Geary pointed out that most domestic violence advocates ask women if they feel safe in their homes. She stated that it is important to establish a relationship with the schools and suggested that we should include them. Ms. Day Geary also inquired into what kind of protocols hospitals were following.

Cynthia Lucas wanted to know if the Council had a timeline for this council? Ms. Thomson mentioned that we have begun to address some issues to fulfill grant requirements. A few of the deliverables on the grant include developing a website, working with faith-based groups and developing a public awareness campaign.

Sandy Cowen Miller indicated that while substance abuse is not the cause of domestic violence, a survey says 75% of violence involves some sort of substance abuse. 90% of women surveyed said substance

abuse did not increase the violence. Ms. Cowen Miller inquired if the Council was represented by an expert on substance abuse?

Mary Wambach added that incredible activities are happening around domestic violence in Maricopa County. She believes the press has been doing a good job reporting and sees a good distribution of male and female. She stressed the need to include those with disabilities and those who are deaf. They are often last to get services because of lack of transportation and access to shelters.

Janice Parker also feels that substance abuse plays a big part in domestic violence. She stated that substance abuse is one tactic the batterer uses to control the victim.

Sandy Kravitz noted that the legislature is creating a multi-disciplinary task force and expressed concern that the result will be another study. Ms Thomson indicated that several legislators are members who are on the Council and will hopefully build on what we're doing here.

Kathleen Ferraro inquired whether there is a member from the family/domestic relations court systems on the Council. She stated that domestic relations often work in opposition to the criminal justice system. She recommended that we recruit a member from the domestic relations courts.

Dr. Paul Eppinger stated the need to coordinate with the Violence Prevention Initiative and incorporate their information. He also stressed the need to pull in clergy from the more fundamentalist groups. Dr Eppinger stated that the more fundamentalist groups tend to have a higher incidence of domestic violence as reported by a family counselor.

Dr. Bradshaw indicated the need to get schools involved is important. It seems that we have overlooked the use of parenting education, health education in the schools, education in the physician's office. She stressed the need to make sure we include prevention and early intervention in these areas.

Paul Oves inquired about the process to begin implementing the recommendations to get results. Ms. Thomson commented that this inquiry today will result in beginning to take action and implement the recommendations.

Dr. Kravitz suggested that one subcommittee could consist of funding agencies working in collaboration to fund domestic violence programs. He stated that the first task of the subcommittee would be to agree on the priorities. Arizona Community Foundation will convene the funders if it is desired.

Paula Garcia inquired as to why there was no representation from DES. Ms. Thomson indicated that the Director of DES was invited to serve on the Council but did not respond. MAG will inquire into another appropriate representative.

John Pombier stated that looking for funding is often dependent on good data. If we do not have good data we cannot demonstrate that our funds are being used wisely.

## 6. Current Work Underway

Mr. Canasi touched on this during his presentation.

Rev. Deborah Lerner reported that there has been a second conference with faith-based organizations. Ms. Cowen Miller responded that her survey did address whether victims attended services at a religious organization. 40-60% of women who responded indicated that they were religious; the number substantially increased with those women who were abused. Many of these women are not comfortable talking to their clergy.

Rev. Lerner stated that October 17, 2000 will be the third faith based gathering. The previous faith based gathering has been distributed on tape and is receiving excellent feedback. Rev. Lerner responded that there were about 250 people attending with extensive outreach to all different types of religious organizations.

Margaretta Brede-Mathis stated that we need to ensure that we have good cultural and ethnic diversity in our faith based subcommittee

Mr. Canasi highlighted the impact of domestic violence on children and a number of issues we need to address in that area. He stated an example of domestic violence occurrences in Tempe where the crisis teams who respond often find the children hiding.

Mr. Canasi also identified workplace issues as another significant area and the importance of involving the corporate leaders in this effort. He commended the corporate representatives who were participating today. Public awareness is another area we need to focus on and how a campaign is critical to dispelling the myths associated with this crime.

#### 7. Call to the Public:

Carla Averil from Area Agency on Aging discussed their two programs and asked to be part of the Council. Councilmember Bilsten agreed that we also have to consider the needs of elderly victims.

Ms. Rivera addressed the issue around substance abuse and whether it is a cause. From research and experience, we know that substance is not a cause. It is about power and control, substance abuse is a factor but not a cause. Many victims turn to drugs and alcohol to cope with the abuse.

Councilmember Garcia talked about denial in the schools and in society. She commented about how we don't want to look at this issue. There is a lot of denial in the race issue that leads to violence and school systems also have great deal of denial. The Councilmember stressed the need to break through the denial as essential to begin the healing process.

Dr. Eppinger inquired if this council is linked to the Vision 2025 Committee. This issue is critical if we are to succeed in 2025. Carol Kratz discussed the Human Services Subcommittee of the Vision 2025 effort. The report will include a domestic violence component.

#### 8. Announcements

Councilmember Bilsten asked for volunteers to work on the mission statement for the Council which would be brought back to the full committee. Volunteers include; Connie Phillips, Tracy Bame, Monalou Callery,

Vince Imbordino, Roger Illingworth, Paulla Garcia.

Ms. Thomson reviewed the future meeting schedule and there were no changes made.

Ms. Wambach asked Ms. Ferraro, who works on the ACADV Advocacy Subcommittee, to provide a legislative update to the Council. Ms. Ferraro stated that the legislature has proposed an \$8 million appropriation.

Councilmember Bilsten asked everyone to send e-mails and make calls to support ACADV in their legislative priorities.

Ms. Ferraro also stated discussed a bill focusing on support for perinatal services for women dealing with substance abuse issues.

Councilmember Bilsten asked about Attorney Generals Napolitano's bill which would make it a federal penalty if domestic violence occurs and children witness. Ms. Ferraro was not sure whether if that bill was going to be proposed again this year. She discussed a bill related to double arrests where many women are charged for defending themselves.

Marie Sullivan stated that Senator Freestone sponsored a bill to appropriate dollars for more school counselors and increase to the number of counselors in elementary schools. She pointed out that not all bills need to come out of social service to affect domestic violence issues. This bill will have definite impact on prevention in schools.

Ms. Thomson pointed out the memo regarding the Corporate Citizenship Initiative Grant in the packet and asked for letters of support from organizations.

Ms. Wammach suggested that we plan an event in October for Domestic Violence Awareness Month.

## 9. Adjourn

Councilmember Bilsten finished by explaining how members will all be requested to serve on a subcommittee. She also stated that we must have a regional approach to link together efforts to make our region safer and benefit from each other's experience. Ms. Thomson stated that a letter will be sent out before the next Council meeting requesting for each councilmember to recruit subcommittee members from their organizations.

Councilmember Bilsten adjourned the meeting at 4 pm.